

chapter 4

evaluation according to national heritage area criteria

The National Park Service has set forth a number of criteria to evaluate proposed National Heritage Areas. One document, *Critical Steps and Criteria for becoming a National Heritage Area* describes four Critical Steps and ten Suggested Criteria. Furthermore, Appendix 1 of the *National Heritage Area Feasibility Study Guidelines* identifies ten types of resource assemblages that contribute to the greater understanding, preservation, and celebration of the Nation's heritage. This chapter evaluates the Little Colorado River Valley in accordance with the criteria contained in these two documents developed by the National Park Service.

CRITICAL STEPS AND CRITERIA FOR BECOMING A NATIONAL HERITAGE AREA

Critical Steps

The *Critical Steps and Criteria for becoming a National Heritage Area* document identifies four Critical Steps that must be completed before

Congressional consideration and designation of a National Heritage Area.

- (1) Completion of a suitability/feasibility study
- (2) Public involvement in the suitability/feasibility study
- (3) Demonstration of widespread public support among heritage area residents for the proposed designation
- (4) Commitment to the proposal from key constituents, which may include governments, industry, and private, non-profit organizations, in addition to area residents

The proposed Little Colorado River Valley National Heritage Area achieved the following with regards to these four Critical Steps.

(1) Completion of a Suitability/Feasibility Study

This document is the feasibility study for the proposed Little Colorado River Valley National Heritage Area. It contains all of the applicable

information indicated in the National Park Service's *National Heritage Area Feasibility Study Guidelines*.

(2) Public Involvement in the Suitability/ Feasibility Study

The Little Colorado River Valley National Heritage Area feasibility study process involved the public throughout its development. The initial ideas for the proposed Area developed out of the expressed needs of communities along the river to effectively protect and promote different resources, primarily in Springerville and Snowflake. The Center for Desert Archaeology had worked with the town government and volunteers of Springerville for a number of years and was invited to a preliminary scoping meeting regarding petroglyph sites in Snowflake. The Center for Desert Archaeology also had working relationships with staff and Hopi consultants at Homol'ovi Ruins State Park. Once the National Heritage Area idea was proposed as one option to address these community needs and a map was devised, the Center for Desert Archaeology conferred with these original partners. They expressed enthusiasm for the idea and then the process of concerted public outreach throughout the watershed began.

A part-time Center for Desert Archaeology staff member conducted the outreach from the fall of 2004 through the summer of 2005, making 13 public presentations during that time. A total of 7 newspaper articles during the same time also relayed the development of the proposed Area to a wider audience. Significant progress was delayed until the Center for Desert Archaeology received an Arizona State Parks Heritage Fund Grant in the spring of 2006 to fund a two-year, full-

time position for the feasibility study process. The new Heritage Programs Coordinator began giving public presentations and conducting community Working Group meetings by November of that year. Since that time, more than 50 public presentations have been given and more than 140 people attended Working Group meetings. Additionally, the proposed Little Colorado River Valley National Heritage Area was the topic of information booths at eight community events since October 2006 and the topic of no less than 22 newspaper articles since July 2006. The Heritage Programs Coordinator also sent monthly updates via email or mail to anyone who requested. People could also sign themselves up to receive Updates by visiting the proposed Little Colorado River Valley National Heritage Area pages on the Center for Desert Archaeology website. By February 2008, the number of people receiving Updates exceeded 650. All past Updates, as well as past formal press releases to media outlets, were kept accessible on the website for continued public access. For more information and detailed listing of public outreach efforts, see Chapter 1.

The heart of the feasibility study itself, the heritage themes, developed directly from public input. A detailed description of this process appears in Chapter 3. Likewise, the General Guidelines for the proposed National Heritage Area were also a direct result of the visions and realities expressed by participants during the Working Group meetings. This process is explained at length in Chapter 2.

The whole feasibility study document also underwent public review and received XXX comments during the comment period. All comments are included in Appendix X. People could

make comments during one of six Working Group meetings, write and mail in comments, or submit comments online.

3. Demonstration of Widespread Public Support Among Heritage Area Residents for the Proposed Designation

The proposed Little Colorado River Valley National Heritage Area has received 57 letters or resolutions of support. The majority of these letters (approximately 50) were written by a variety of individuals, independent businesses owners, large landowners, private non-profit organizations, and local governments while the others have been written by educational institutions and state, federal, or tribal agencies and departments.

Additionally, approximately 150 people gave a total of more than 400 hours of their time to attend Working Group meetings and guide the development of the future Area.

4. Commitment to the Proposal from Key Constituents, which may Include Governments, Industry, and Private, Non-profit Organizations in Addition to Local Residents

In addition to formal support given by the people mentioned in Critical Step Number Three, a number of state, federal, and tribal governments and agencies also gave their support for the proposed Area. The Petrified Forest National Park agreed at the onset of the feasibility study to act as the lead federal agent for the proposed Little Colorado River Valley National Heritage Area.

SUGGESTED CRITERIA

The Critical Steps and Criteria for becoming a National Heritage Area

document also lists ten Suggested Criteria to ascertain whether a proposed region qualifies for National Heritage Area status.

- (1) The area has an assemblage of natural, historic, or cultural resources that together represent distinctive aspects of American heritage worthy of recognition, conservation, interpretation, and continuing use, and are best managed as such an assemblage through partnerships among public and private entities, and by combining diverse and sometimes noncontiguous resources and active communities
- (2) The area reflects traditions, customs, beliefs, and folk life that are a valuable part of the national story
- (3) The area provides outstanding opportunities to conserve natural, cultural, historic, and/or scenic features
- (4) The area provides outstanding recreational and educational opportunities
- (5) Resources that are important to the identified theme or themes of the area retain a degree of integrity capable of supporting interpretation
- (6) Residents, business interests, non-profit organizations, and governments within the proposed area that are involved in the planning, have developed a conceptual financial plan that outlines the roles for all participants including the federal government, and have demonstrated support for designation of the area
- (7) The proposed management entity and units of government supporting the designation are willing to commit to work in

- partnership to develop the heritage area
- (8) The proposal is consistent with continued economic activity in the area
 - (9) A conceptual boundary map is supported by the public
 - (10) The management entity proposed to plan and implement the project is described

The proposed Little Colorado River Valley fulfills the Suggested Criteria in the following ways.

The area has an assemblage of natural, historic, or cultural resources that together represent distinctive aspects of American heritage worthy of recognition, conservation, interpretation, and continuing use, and are best managed as such an assemblage through partnerships among public and private entities, and by combining diverse and sometimes noncontiguous resources and active communities.

The seven heritage themes of Chapter 3 describe in detail the natural, historic, and cultural resources found within the Little Colorado River Valley. Each of those chapters also contains a listing of related resources in the region that reflect that particular theme. The related resource lists, though lengthy, are not absolutely comprehensive due to issues of cultural sensitivity regarding many Native American sites and traditions and also due to the impossibility of documenting every possible resource in a living and ever-changing landscape. Still, the lists reflect the wealth of resources for any of the heritage themes that can be found throughout the watershed. Often, one resource reflects a number of themes. For example, the Hubbell

Trading Post National Historic Site in Ganado reflects the theme of Living from the Land due to recent restoration of native gardens and an historic orchard, the theme of Expressions of Art and Life due to its current and historic role as a trading post and current Native American Art Auctions, as well as the theme of Native Nations, again due to its role as a trading post and auction site and due to its location in the Navajo Nation. Similarly, the 26 Bar Ranch in Eagar reflects the Living from the Land theme because of its history as John Wayne's ranch, but it can also reflect the Native Nations and Archaeology themes because it is now owned and operated by the Hopi Tribe and contains petroglyphs within its boundaries. El Morro National Monument reflects the Sacred and Enchanted Landscapes theme because of its striking geology and importance in Native culture, the Trails, Roads, and Rails of the West theme because of its importance as a reliable water source for Native, Spanish, and American travelers and explorers and due to the petroglyphs and inscriptions they left, and the Native Nations and Archaeology themes because of the pueblo ruins located on top of the bluff. Countless other individual sites reflect multiple associations across time and cultures.

These resources are intricately related to each other. El Morro National Monument relates directly to the development of the Beale Wagon Road, ATSF railroad, Route 66, and modern-day I-40. The natural resource of the vast forests ringing the watershed fueled the development of the railroad and the founding of several towns. Ranchlands continue to provide a lifestyle for individual families, but also contribute to the open character of the landscape so intricately associated with the Southwest and, if managed

with this intent in mind, provide habitat for native and wild plants and animals. Because these resources cross multiple political and jurisdictional boundaries—state, federal, tribal, private, and local government—and hold significance to any number of individuals or cultures that may or may not be the actual owners of such resources, a willing partnership approach is a most appropriate way to address future planning for such resources.

The heritage and resources of the Little Colorado region are worthy of recognition, conservation, interpretation and continuing use because they define critical moments in the development of the United States as a whole and in the development of particular cultures and lifestyles of people whose lives add to the rich diversity of the Nation.

The area reflects traditions, customs, beliefs, and folk life that are a valuable part of the national story.

The Little Colorado River Valley has been home to the ancestors of modern-day Hopi and Zuni for a minimum of thousands of years. The development of the ancestral cultures into the distinct Hopi and Zuni cultures of today occurred more than 1,000 years ago. Generally speaking, the Hopi and Zuni have been living in the same basic vicinity as they are today for approximately 1,000 years. Few other cultural groups in the present-day United States can claim such a long and unbroken connection to a particular landscape. The Navajo Nation, approximately half of which lies within the Little Colorado River watershed, is the largest Native Nation in the United States both in terms of size of population and size of reservation. All

three tribes are nationally and internationally renowned for their arts and crafts traditions and in general for their unique ways of life.

Ranching and the cowboy lifestyle is a large part of the national identity, even for those who have never ridden a horse, roped a cow, walked with a flock of sheep to a summer mountain pasture, or awakened before dawn to help in the birthing of a calf. Few images speak to the American soul more than that of a lone cowboy—in a Stetson hat, weathered jeans, pearl-snapped shirt, fringed chaps, silk neckerchief, and leather gloves—riding his way across an open range.

Ranching is not just a part of the Little Colorado's past, it is a continuing part of it present and future. Ranchers and other agriculturalists, both Native and non-Native, are fusing traditional practices with modern twists to respond to ever-changing economic, social, and ecological conditions. They are simultaneously keeping a vibrant tradition alive while adding another chapter to its long and colorful history.

The area provides outstanding opportunities to conserve natural, cultural, historic, and/or scenic features.

Despite the region's rate of population growth—Arizona as a whole grew greater than 30 percent over each of the last four decades and New Mexico has grown an average of about 20 percent over each of the last three decades—the Little Colorado region has been less affected than other parts of the states. The Little Colorado region remains primarily rural and therefore the potential to retain the natural and scenic quality of the area is high. Culturally, the region contains a number of unique lifestyles that are

rooted in deep tradition and yet adjusting to modern realities. Numerous natural and cultural conservation efforts are at various stages of development throughout the proposed Little Colorado River Valley National Heritage Area. The following is a partial listing and brief description of some of these initiatives. Additional initiatives were also previously described Chapter 1. These are but a small number of existing examples of the possibility that exists within the watershed as a whole.

- ◆ **Babbitt Ranches:** In 2001, Babbitt Ranches placed more than 34,000 acres of private land into a conservation easement to preclude any future mining, subdividing, or development of the property. Babbitt Ranches continues to look for additional easements or other conservation options for some of their range that is not currently protected.
- ◆ **Billy Creek Restoration:** The Town of Pinetop-Lakeside enjoys numerous mountain streams and lakes that provide natural beauty, recreational opportunities, and critical water resources and habitat. Working with a private stream restoration firm, the Town secured an Arizona Water Protection Fund grant in late 2007 for the first phase of restoration along Billy Creek. The area is zoned open space and will retain its natural character while public access will be facilitated in the future through trailheads and picnic areas.
- ◆ **Diablo Trust:** This organization, formed in 1993, is a partnership of two family-owned ranches, each with a history of several generations in Arizona. The Diablo Trust is committed to the dynamic blend of viable cattle ranching, wildlife habitat, ecological conservation, public engagement, and innovative solutions on their lands in eastern Coconino County.
- ◆ **Flagstaff, Gallup, and Springerville:** All three have plans and committees working toward the preservation of open space in their respective communities.
- ◆ **Homol'ovi Ruins State Park:** Homol'ovi Ruins State Park contains four major pueblo sites, built by ancestors of modern-day Hopi, that number more than XXX rooms each as well as smaller pueblos. Through a Memorandum of Understanding, the Hopi Tribe has taken an increasing role in recent years in developing interpretive plans and future management goals for the Park. Hopi cultural events, lectures, and youth program visits to the Park have increased dramatically under the guidance of Hopi liaisons.
- ◆ **Hubbell Trading Post National Historic Site:** There is ongoing preservation of the trading post structures. Recent initiatives have been undertaken to revitalize the larger cultural landscape of the trading post by re-introducing agriculture and heritage orchard species which were present during the time of the Hubbell family's homestead as well as returning the Pueblo Colorado wash which runs through the site to its condition before the invasion of exotic species along its banks.
- ◆ **Natwani Coalition:** This Hopi organization promotes the return to traditional Hopi methods of farming and traditional varieties of crops. The Coalition works with school-aged children to teach them agricultural techniques and has also restored

traditional farming sites along springs on the reservation.

- ◆ **Picture Canyon:** Located in the southeast side of Flagstaff, Picture Canyon earned its name from the very high concentration of petroglyphs found on its rock boulders and currently lies on state-owned land. Coconino County Board of Supervisors and volunteers have been working for a number of years to remove invasive plant species and are also exploring ways to ensure protection of the site into the future.
- ◆ **Show Low Bluff archaeological park:** Show Low Bluff is a private housing development that announced in March 2008 that it will set aside 46 acres for the preservation of approximately 1,000 petroglyphs in the subdivision. Show Low Bluff will make a privately owned park that is publically accessible out of the area and has already begun to work with the Arizona Site Steward Program to develop a special group of monitors for the site.
- ◆ **Town of Springerville:** Springerville became a Preserve America community in 2006. It restored its Madonna of the Trail statue in the same year (one of only twelve in the country placed by the Daughters of the American Revolution) and the town is currently working on the restoration of its historic school building.
- ◆ **Zuni:** The murals of Our Lady of Guadalupe, a 17th century Spanish mission, are in need of repair due to deterioration of the church walls. Partial support for the restoration has been received from the New Mexico legislature and the Save America's

Treasures fund of the National Park Service.

The area provides outstanding recreational and educational opportunities.

The Outdoor Recreation section of Chapter 3 describes in detail the wealth and variety of outdoor recreation opportunities the Little Colorado region offers residents and visitors alike. The experience of outdoor recreation, no matter what the actual activity, cannot be separated from the landscape in which it takes place. The incredible diversity and unmatched character of Little Colorado geology and ecology makes outdoor recreation an exciting, ever-changing experience. That, added to the vast amount of public lands, means that outdoor recreation opportunities are plentiful and open to all.

Quality educational opportunities regarding natural and cultural heritage go hand-in-hand with having an intact landscape. Because the vast majority of the Little Colorado region has not been urbanized, the geological and ecological stories are writ large and obvious across the landscape. The edge of a lava flow from a shield volcano near Springerville is easily identifiable. The natural route of ancient passes through mountain ranges is easily seen from the top of El Morro National Monument. Ribbons of green vegetation, able to be seen at considerable distances because few large structures or other built environments obscure the view, announce the flow and role of water in basically arid country. Natural and cultural heritage education is emphasized at many sites and locations throughout the watershed and

numerous schools and non-profit organizations promote natural and cultural learning in a more general sense. The Colorado Plateau Studies Program at Coconino Community College (CCC) and the Sustainable Living Series of classes at both CCC and Northland Pioneer College are two such examples, the Elderhostel Program at Northern Arizona University is another. The STAR School in Flagstaff and the St. Michael's Association for Special Education serve younger learners with a curriculum based in regional ecology and culture. The Flagstaff Chapter of the Arizona Native Plant Society sponsors lectures and plant walks during the warmer months and the Plateau Sciences Society in Gallup, in addition to providing a wide variety of educational opportunities to its members, holds a public Native Plant Sale every spring and promotes the knowledge and use of native plants in landscaping. The Arizona Ethnobotanical Research Association in Flagstaff studies, documents, and promotes the use traditional plants and conducts periodic field schools that bring students in contact with Native American elders as teachers. The Museum of Northern Arizona's Ventures Program takes participants on multi-day trips led by expert scientists, writers, artists, and other guides. Numerous other educational programs sponsored by schools, local historical societies, museums, the National Park Service and Forest Service, many other organizations add to the educational opportunities available, and to the potential for more coordinated, comprehensive, and diverse learning experiences. National Heritage Area designation could facilitate the creative networking and resource sharing that would enhance the many efforts that already exist.

Resources that are important to the identified theme or themes of the area retain a degree of integrity capable of supporting interpretation.

Many of the sites discussed in the heritage theme chapters and listed in each chapter's related resources section enjoy previous special designations from the national or state level such as National Monuments, state parks and trails, scenic byways, or other similar designations. Additionally, all of the National Register sites that occur within the watershed, most of which are specifically mentioned in the heritage theme chapters, are listed in Chapter 5, Supporting Resources. All of the sites in the related resource sections of the heritage theme chapters were suggested by Working Group participants, showing that the resources have a certain degree of quality and public awareness and are perceived positively by the community.

Residents, business interests, non-profit organizations, and governments within the proposed area are involved in the planning, have developed a conceptual financial plan that outlines the roles for all participants including the federal government, and have demonstrated support for designation of the area.

The extensive public involvement in the development of the proposed Little Colorado River Valley National Heritage Area thus far is detailed in earlier chapters of this feasibility study. Chapter 1 gives a complete listing of all public presentations, information booth venues, newspaper articles, public Working Group meeting dates, an explanation of the monthly Updates, and a listing of all 57 formal letters or

resolutions of support received. Additionally, Appendix X includes copies of each letter or resolution. These letters and resolutions demonstrate support from local businesses, individuals, non-profits, local and tribal governments, state, tribal, and federal agencies, land owners, and educational institutions. Chapter 2 describes how public input shaped the development of the General Guidelines for the proposed Area and Chapter 3 explains how public input led directly to the seven heritage themes included in this study. Public involvement is also summarized in response to the Critical Steps listed at the beginning of this chapter. A conceptual financial plan appears in Chapter 2.

The proposed management entity and units of government supporting the designation are willing to commit to working in partnership to develop the heritage area.

Local government officials and staff have been directly involved in facilitating resolutions of support for the proposed Area. Also, many such individuals have given their time to attend Working Group meetings or lend their assistance in contacting additional potential partners for the project. The Town of Pinetop-Lakeside and the City of Holbrook allowed the use of their council chambers to conduct Working Group meetings which were attended by people from many surrounding communities. In some cases, Working Group meeting locations alternated between two communities in a larger sub-region, but government officials or staff were committed to attending the meeting irrespective of the specific location.

The proposal is consistent with continued economic activity in the area.

As Chapter 6 explains, tourism already is a significant portion of revenues for most communities in the Little Colorado River watershed. As Chapter 6 also explains, tourism as an industry is projected to continue its steady growth for the next several decades. Tourism trend studies show that heritage tourists – those keenly interested in learning about and experiencing the true character of a particular place – will comprise ever increasing percentage of the total tourism market. National Heritage Area designation, therefore, will only serve to emphasize the Little Colorado River watershed as a region where distinctiveness of place is vibrant, diverse, and recognizable. Heritage tourism promotion can contribute to the economy in a variety of ways: it can attract visitors from outside the area; it can result in visitors staying longer in the area; and it can attract local residents to travel within their own region, thus keeping their leisure dollars in the general area.

Tourism is not the only manner in which the designation can enhance economic activity. Many current National Heritage Areas place considerable focus on downtown and local economy revitalization. The Delaware and Lehigh National Heritage Corridor Market Towns Initiative, the Path of Progress National Heritage Route's Progress Fund, and Wheeling National Heritage Area's Adaptive Reuse Studies are good examples. Natural areas and pre-historic or historic site restoration provide jobs as would additional or increased educational programming.

A conceptual boundary map is supported by the public.

The Center for Desert Archaeology received enthusiasm for the proposed Little Colorado River Valley National Heritage Area with the boundaries as the river's watershed at the very beginning of the process in 2004. Since that time, 57 individuals and organizations of all types have given support for the proposed Area with the original boundaries.

In the winter of 2007-08, some individuals and organizations began to express concern that the proposed Area was simply too large. Concerns included potential future administrative problems with an Area of this size, the worry that the financial and other resources a National Heritage Area could bring to the region would be too diluted to be effective, and that "locking up" this much acreage was in general a frightful concept because of fears of additional regulations or infringement on private property rights.

In January 2008, the Center for Desert Archaeology developed an alternative boundary based on the comments received by those concerned with the size and in respect to the regions that had shown the most active support up to that time. (This alternative map appears as Appendix X.) Briefly, the alternative boundaries eliminated Catron County and most of Coconino County except for the portion that is part of the Hopi Reservation and the Tuba City and Birdsprings Chapters of the Navajo Reservation. Trying to respect natural and cultural realities, the Birdsprings Chapter was included due to the fact that the Little Colorado River runs through the Chapter and that half of the chapter lies within Navajo County. The parts of the Hopi

Reservation falling inside of Coconino County were also included so as not to artificially divide the reservation. Likewise, the villages of Upper and Lower Moenkopi, although occurring within Coconino County and separated from the main Hopi Reservation, are nonetheless Hopi tribal lands and it was felt they should be included along with the rest of the reservation. Tuba City Chapter was also included due to its proximity and shared history with the villages of Moenkopi. The Center then asked a variety of people who were familiar with the project for their input regarding the alternative boundary. These individuals lived and worked across the watershed: two from Coconino County, four from Navajo County, one from Apache County, one from McKinley County, and one who worked on the Navajo Reservation. The responses varied slightly, but the general consensus was that eliminating Coconino County would be detrimental to the proposed Area as a whole due to the amount of natural and cultural resources it contains that are connected to the rest of the region.

Concerning potential future administrative problems, the proposed Area is large and it is recognized that its administration will present unique challenges that smaller Areas may not experience. At 26,000+ square miles, the proposed Area would be the second largest of the 37 currently-designated National Heritage Areas (Tennessee Civil War National Heritage Area is the largest at 41,143 square miles), although it would be only marginally bigger than the third-largest Area (Freedom's Frontier National Heritage Area at 25,547 square miles). Distance is certainly a factor, although because of the rural and open character of the landscape, the number of people and political entities with which to coordinate is not

greater than in Areas with denser populations and denser concentrations of cities and towns. Approaches to minimize the problems associated with distance are addressed in a preliminary fashion in Chapter 2 when the management entity is described.

The worry that financial and other resources will be too diluted to be effective is also related to the size of the proposed Area. The alternative map, even though it would have reduced the proposed Area by approximately 8,000 square miles, would not have reduced the size enough to significantly alter the dollar-to-acre ratio that people concerned with this worry often cite. Many of those concerned with the size look to Yuma Crossing National Heritage Area as an example, which is the smallest of all 37 National Heritage Areas. Yuma Crossing has facilitated positive changes for the Yuma community, however it is atypical of the size of most National Heritage Areas.

Other concerns about the proposed Little Colorado River Valley National Heritage Area center around the fear of land being “locked up” or subject to additional regulation or infringement of private property rights. The Area is perceived by some as having the power or authority to change zoning ordinances, public logging permits, and other land management regulations. As National Heritage Areas are non-regulatory, the designation, by law, cannot interfere with private property rights or future development of any kind on public or private lands. An incident occurred in the Yuma Crossing National Heritage Area in 2004 in which a *city* employee of Yuma, not an employee of the Yuma Crossing National Heritage Area, acted outside of his or her authority and improperly tried to use the designation as a reason

to deny a landowner the right to erect a billboard. National Heritage Area staff worked quickly to have the City of Yuma reverse its inappropriate action, however, the incident caused much anger and fear among private property owners and ultimately resulted in the reduction in size of Yuma Crossing. This incident has caused some private property owners throughout the Little Colorado River watershed to approach the idea of a proposed National Heritage Area with caution.

The management entity proposed to plan and implement the project is described.

The proposed management entity is described at length in Chapter 2. Chapter 2 also contains a conceptual financial plan to serve as a starting point for the new management entity.

**NATIONAL HERITAGE AREAS
FEASIBILITY STUDY GUIDELINES,
APPENDIX 1: EXAMPLES OF
NATIONALLY DISTINCTIVE
LANDSCAPES**

The National Park Service developed a comprehensive set of guidelines for National Heritage Area feasibility studies. Appendix 1 of this document lists ten different types of resource assemblages that indicate a region of national distinction. Appendix 1 describes nationally distinctive landscapes as:

...places that contain important regional and national stories that, together with their associated natural and/or cultural resources, enable the American people to understand, preserve and celebrate key components of the multi-faceted character of the Nation's heritage. The landscapes are often

places that represent and contain identifiable assemblages of resources with integrity associated with one or more of the following:

1. *important historical periods of the Nation and its people;*
2. *major events, persons and groups that contributed substantively to the Nation's history, customs, beliefs, and folklore;*
3. *distinctive cultures and cultural mores;*
4. *major industries and technological, business and manufacturing innovations/practices, labor movements and labor advancements that contributed substantively to the economic growth of the Nation and the well-being of its people;*
5. *transportation innovations and routes that played central roles in important military actions, settlement, migration, and commerce;*
6. *social movements that substantively influenced past and present day society;*
7. *American art, crafts, literature and music;*
8. *distinctive architecture and architectural periods and movements;*
9. *major scientific discoveries and advancements; and*
10. *other comparable representations that together with their associated resources substantively contributed to the Nation's heritage.*

The proposed Little Colorado River Valley National Heritage Area meets these ten criteria. In-depth descriptions of the region's contributions to the Nation's heritage are given throughout the heritage theme chapters and this entire study, but brief accounts tailored

to each of the ten points of Appendix 1 are given here.

Important Historical Periods of the Nation and Its People

The entire Little Colorado River watershed was ceded to the United States in the 1848 Treaty of Guadalupe Hidalgo following the Mexican American War. This cession consisted of the entire modern-day states of California, Nevada, and Utah, significant portions of Arizona, New Mexico, and Colorado, and a southwestern strip of Wyoming. The cession equals roughly 1/6 of the total land area of the present-day United States. Nearly 300 years before this cession, the region witnessed some of the first Spanish explorers to travel into what is now the American Southwest and parts of the western Plains states.

Before the Spanish, Native tribes, some of whom are now entering their second millennium in their villages, established the Little Colorado as their homeland. Before these lasting villages were established, ancestors of modern-day tribes also lived and migrated through the Little Colorado region. After the cession, the Little Colorado region played a significant role as the nation moved westward. It holds one of the major east-west corridors that has been used, and is still used, by rail and road alike to link the two sides of the continent together and to the interior of the country.

Major Events, Persons, and Groups that Contributed Substantively to the Nation's History, Customs, Beliefs, and Folklore

The ranching history of the Little Colorado embodies the essence of what

is popularly thought of as the American West and the image of the American cowboy on the open range. The Hashknife Ranch, in the heart of the Little Colorado River Valley, was once the third largest ranch in all of North America.

The Atchison, Topeka & Santa Fe Railroad also contributed significantly to the national impression of the Southwest. Through its advertisements, train décor, tours, sponsored artists, and architecture, ATSF both introduced the rest of the country to the Southwest and simultaneously shaped what they saw and experienced.

Distinctive Cultures and Cultural Mores

The Little Colorado River watershed is home to three Indian Reservations, including the largest reservation in the United States (Navajo). All three tribes, Navajo, Hopi, and Zuni, are known for their high degree of traditionalism in comparison to many other tribes across the country. Traditional religious beliefs and observances, and distinctive languages, foods, arts, music, dances, and economic practices are still in place on the reservations and in varying degrees with tribal members who live off the reservations in surrounding communities.

The Little Colorado region is also home to a significant number of Mormons whose differences in beliefs forced their relocation in the mid-19th century from the middle sections of the United States to the then-Western frontier lands. Mormon migration and settlement in Arizona and western New Mexico was a direct result of church teachings and a desire to spread the religion over both American continents.

Major Industries and Technological, Business, and Manufacturing Innovations/Practices, Labor Movements, and Labor Advancements that Contributed Substantively to the Economic Growth of the Nation and the Well-being of Its People

The logging, cattle, mining, and railroad industries are inextricably linked in the Little Colorado region and are also inextricably linked to the prosperity of the nation as a whole. Railroads provided for efficient movement of people and goods from one end of the country to another, and everywhere in between, at a scale unprecedented in previous eras. Railroads carried lumber, mining products, and food to distant markets (often in the east) while the lumber, mining products, and agriculture industries literally built the railroad and fed its workers. Beyond material goods, the railroad also transported people making leisure travel or travel for business more feasible. The impact of the railroad and related Western industries on the entire country is hard to overstate.

Transportation Innovations and Routes that Played Central Roles in Important Military Actions, Settlement, Migration, and Commerce

The Little Colorado region has witnessed thousands of years of migrations by people whose descendants still live in the area today. Later Mormon migrations and the economic and social impact of the railroad have already been discussed in Numbers 3 and 4. Route 66 added another major layer to the history of movement and settlement along its

notorious east-west corridor, and a whole new style of commerce oriented toward the new invention of the automobile. From the Dust Bowl migrations out of the central Plains to the post-WWII era of prosperity to the 21st century's focus on places of unique character, Route 66 has held the promise of discovery, freedom, adventure, and a distinctly American way of both losing oneself and finding oneself all at the same time. Route 66 was specifically designed to stir economic growth in the rural communities it touched. It certainly succeeded in that goal, and also succeeded in stirring the hearts and souls of generations of Americans.

Social Movements that Substantively Influenced Past and Present Day Society

The mining and logging camps of the Little Colorado did experience worker strikes as were common in many parts of the country where such industries prevailed. While their impact was significant locally, other larger labor movements had much greater influence in the national social fabric and development of worker relations.

The Little Colorado region is at the forefront of a recent social shift occurring in this country regarding sustainable and local economic development. Examples include:

- ◆ The commitment of Coconino County to pursue sustainable economic development on a variety of fronts
- ◆ Several public and private partnerships to develop wind power (Arizona Public Service (APS), Northern Arizona University, City of Flagstaff, Bureau of Land Management, private landowners and private businesses)

- ◆ Efforts of non-profits (Native Movement) and educational institutions (Coconino Community College, Northland Pioneer College, and Northern Arizona University) to promote sustainable building techniques
- ◆ Numerous private enterprises and community organizations related to sustainable agriculture or other businesses
- ◆ Many of these efforts are mentioned within the heritage theme chapters. Combined, they demonstrate that residents and local officials of the Little Colorado region are thinking progressively and for the future. These efforts and cooperating organizations also provide a wealth of resources and information for those who want to pursue an alternative lifestyle aimed at reducing negative impacts on the landscape.

American Art, Crafts, Literature, Music

Navajo, Hopi, and Zuni arts and crafts are known the world over for their distinctive style, materials, and high quality craftsmanship. Significant collections exist in many American cities outside of the Little Colorado region and in international cities as well. While some materials for art and craft production were acquired through trade, in prehistoric times the vast majority of materials and design patterns were direct reflections of the resources and lived experience of the Little Colorado region. In modern times, ancient and traditional designs are still highly prized among artists and buyers. Even for artists who break from the strictly traditional, their artwork still echoes the aesthetics developed by their culture over

centuries. The most common Native art forms are pottery, jewelry, weavings, and carvings of stone or wood. Music and dance, though artistic and definitely distinctive to a particular tribe or society within a tribe, are usually more religious in nature.

Award-winning author Tony Hillerman has written 18 mystery novels as well as other fiction and non-fiction books pertaining to the Navajo culture, the culture of others living in the Southwest, and the landscape. His books are noted for their cultural details.

Distinctive Architecture and Architectural Periods and Movements

Mary Colter worked extensively in the Mission Revival and Pueblo Revival style of architecture. Her work for the Fred Harvey Company and AT&T Railroad helped to spread the popularity and awareness of these styles that came to signify Southwest architecture in the minds of Americans across the country. The major basis for her designs was, of course, authentic pueblo buildings themselves. Developed and perfected over centuries and in complete harmony with the materials and climate prevalent in the Southwest, the structures of Native Americans were so indicative of their lifestyle that the Spanish used the term *pueblo*, meaning "town," to refer to the people themselves. The term has crossed centuries, languages, and cultures and refers to both an actual structure or an entire culturally distinct group of Native Americans.

Pueblos, the structures, are multi-unit buildings consisting of connected square rooms with or without

passageways between them, thick stone or adobe mud walls, often two stories or more, with large wooden crossbeams forming a ceiling upon which smaller branches and grass are laid in opposing directions and sealed with mud. In past times, pueblo rooms had no doors and were entered via a ladder and hole in their flat roofs. Many examples of authentic prehistoric pueblo structures remain in the Little Colorado region. The architectural elements characteristic of pueblos— adobe, rounded wall corners, large wooden ceiling beams (*vigas*) that protrude from the exterior walls, an earthen color scheme, flat roofs, and a profile that suggests multiple layers—are also found in many modern buildings regardless of the method in which they were built.

Similarly, Navajo hogans are as unique to the Navajo as pueblos are to the Hopi, Zuni, and other Pueblo tribes. Eight-sided with the entrance to the east, hogans are the traditional dwelling structure of Navajos. Even today when many have other types of housing, many homesites still have a hogan for traditional religious or other purposes. Spotting a hogan from the side of the road while driving is one sure way a traveler knows he or she has entered Navajo territory.

Major Scientific Discoveries and Advancements

The extreme elevational changes present in the Little Colorado region led biologist C. Hart Merriam, one of the original founders of the National Geographic Society, to develop the concept of life zones. Life zones describe a certain grouping of plants and animals that occur together at different altitudes or at different latitudes. His concept has been altered

and improved upon since first developed in 1889, but remains a basic tenet in the ecological sciences and in the minds of the general public.

Major astronomical discoveries also occurred in the Little Colorado region. Lowell Observatory in Flagstaff was built in 1894 and is one of the oldest observatories in the West. It is perhaps most famous for the discovery of Pluto in 1930, but has made other equally impressive discoveries as well. These include data gathered by astronomer Vesto Melvin Slipher that led to the realization that the universe is expanding, the variation in brightness of Halley's Comet, the presence of oxygen on Jupiter's moon Ganymede, the three largest known stars, the co-discovery of the rings of Uranus, and the discovery of a number of planets orbiting stars in the Milky Way galaxy. Lowell Observatory is now in a partnership with the Discovery Channel to build the 4.2-meter Discovery Channel Telescope, which is planned to be operational by 2010. The telescope will research Near Earth Objects, extrasolar planets, and objects in the Kuiper Belt that lie just beyond our solar system.

Meteor Crater is an example of what happens when space meets Earth. Long considered a volcanic crater, a young Eugene Shoemaker proved in 1960 what one of the crater's earlier owners had always suspected since the turn of the century – that it was caused by a meteor impact. Meteor Crater is the first proven meteor impact site on earth and the best-preserved. The information gained at Meteor Crater led to the development of the field of astrogeology and the identification of

other meteor impact sites around the world and on the Moon. Meteor Crater was used as a training ground for the Apollo astronauts for their lunar landings. Shoemaker went on to an impressive career in astronomy and astrogeology, winning the National Medal of Science in 1992.

Native Americans have long known of the intricate relationship between the movement of the stars and planets to cycles on earth. Many petroglyphs, and even entire structures, are thought to mark the annual movements of the sun or moon. The astronomical purpose of these markers is only recently being re-discovered by non-Natives today.

Both nationally and internationally, the Little Colorado region is known by geologists and paleontologists for exposures of Mesozoic-aged rock and the fossil wealth it contains. The region, as a whole, is in a process of erosion, which is constantly leading to new fossil exposures and subsequent discoveries. The geologic resources already discovered yielded enough fossil remains to allow a detailed reconstruction of a key time in earth's evolutionary history, the late Triassic.

Other Comparable Representations that Together with Their Associated Resources Substantively Contributed to the Nation's Heritage

The previous nine criteria, as well as the rest of the study, adequately explain the heritage of the Little Colorado and its significance both regionally and nationally.